

**BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION
OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA**



FILED

08-24-07

04:59 PM

Order Instituting Rulemaking to Implement the
Commission's Procurement Incentive Framework and to
Examine the Integration of Greenhouse Gas Emissions
Standards into Procurement Policies

Rulemaking 06-04-009
(Filed April 13, 2007)

COMMENTS OF SEMPRA GLOBAL ON DRAFT INTERIM OPINION

Theodore E. Roberts

Attorney for Sempra Global
101 Ash Street, HQ 12B
San Diego, CA 92101-3017
Telephone: (619) 699-5111
Facsimile: (619) 699-5027
E-mail: troberts@sempra.com

August 24, 2007

**BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION
OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA**

Order Instituting Rulemaking to Implement the
Commission's Procurement Incentive Framework and to
Examine the Integration of Greenhouse Gas Emissions
Standards into Procurement Policies

Rulemaking 06-04-009
(Filed April 13, 2007)

COMMENTS OF SEMPRA GLOBAL ON DRAFT INTERIM OPINION

I. INTRODUCTION

In accordance with Rules 14.3 and 14.6 of the Commission's Rules of Practice and Procedure, Sempra Global herewith files its comments on the Proposed Interim Opinion of Reporting and Tracking of Greenhouse Gas Emissions in the Electricity Sector (the "PD") that was publicly released on August 15, 2007. Sempra Global is commenting on only a single issue, namely, the discussion in Section V.B.2.(a), which states that:

[I]n our opinion it is unlikely that new contracts with existing generation sources would produce real reductions in GHG emissions, since most, if not all, of existing power plants would run the same regardless of any new contract. Therefore, we recommend that ARB attribute emissions for purchases from specified sources based on emissions of the specified resource only if (a) the purchase is made through a PPA that was in effect prior to January 1, 2008 and either is still in effect or has been renewed without interruption, or (b) the purchase is made through a PPA from a power plant that became operational on or after January 1, 2008. PD, at p. 21.

Global submits that this language is not supported by record evidence, is speculative, contrary to the goals of AB 32, and arguably unlawful with respect to existing generating units. For those reasons, the Commission should reject this language and require that load-serving entities report and track the greenhouse gas ("GHG") emissions of existing units subject to

source-specific contracts according to their actual emissions rates, and not simply assign the default emissions factors applied to power delivered from unspecified resources.

Sempra Global stands to suffer substantial prejudice under this rule, and anticipates that this prejudice would be exacerbated and continued if the Air Resources Board (“ARB”) were to continue the rule beyond the 2008 reporting year. This prejudice would be counterproductive to the goals of the recommendations and the overall California program to curb greenhouse-gas emissions. While the issue of contract shuffling with which the Commission is concerned and the Proposed Decision is attempting to address may be a legitimate concern, the remedy is misdirected, poorly crafted and could, if continued beyond 2008, result in the execution of new contracts with coal-fired generating units since those units would only benefit from the rule.

Further, to the extent that load-serving entities report 2008 emissions under the proposed rule and that this level of emissions is used to determine the emission- abatement or -mitigation requirements for those entities beginning in 2012, the power industry’s reported emissions, and long-term program emission-reduction burdens, could be higher than they should be, with a concomitant increase in the industry’s compliance costs to the detriment of all California retail customers.

II. COMMENTS

A. The record in this proceeding does not support adoption of the proposed rule.

The PD appears to have drawn its conclusion that new contracts with existing units will not achieve real GHG emissions reductions from language on page 15 concerning the issue of contract shuffling. The concern has to do with the *possibility* that some load-serving entities *might* sign power purchase agreements with low-emitting resources to achieve faux reductions in GHG emissions while continuing to operate their higher-emitting plants, thus achieving no real

GHG emissions reduction. While this is a legitimate concern, the proposed solution is overly broad and creates additional problems. The record is lacking with respect to the number and size of contracts set to expire prior to 2012, their terms, the operating history of the units, and so forth. Sempra Global believes it is unduly speculative, and therefore arbitrary and capricious, for the Commission to adopt a rule based on such speculation.

The dispatch of generation is a function of numerous variables in the market, among which are electricity demand (which is itself driven by uncertainties of weather and economic conditions), hydroelectric availability, fuel prices and transmission availability, all of which are dynamic and interrelated. Added to this mix is, of course, the terms of the contract(s) between the unit(s) and the load-serving entity(ies). Thus, the PD's conclusion that existing units will continue to be operated identically to past operations is misplaced. Such conclusion is overly simplistic and necessarily makes a number of unfounded assumptions regarding each of the variables mentioned, along with the contract terms.

A unit under contract today to provide summer peaking or ancillary services might sign a new contract where it would serve as a dispatchable intermediate baseload unit in the future, or vice versa. At the same time, generation retirements, load growth, changes in system topography and transmission upgrades or derates all would impact unit dispatch. With so many variables operative, the assumption that a unit will operate next year (and beyond) in the same manner as it is today is unsupported, even in the absence of the new GHG emissions reduction program. The numerous assumptions and issues of fact required to reach this conclusion are not in the record, which consists of two days of workshops followed by a Joint Staff Report and comments on the staff report. There has been no factual development in the record that would provide the needed evidentiary basis for the PD's conclusions. Most importantly, logic would compel a finding that,

pursuant to A 32, using source-specific emissions factors for as many units as possible provides greater clarity and transparency, along with the meritorious effect of assuring that low-emitting resources operate to the maximum extent possible, displacing higher emitting resources in the dispatch order. The proposed rule undermines these effects and benefits, and should be rejected.

Sempra Global recognizes that the Commission's recommendations to the ARB, if adopted, are only intended to affect reporting and tracking of greenhouse-gas emissions by load-serving entities for the 2008 operating year and that the Commission intends to undertake a comprehensive review of the reporting and tracking rules for the power sector in 2010. Nevertheless, because any 2008 recommendations (and, if adopted by ARB, the 2008 rules) would carry the weight of precedent and may receive some beneficial presumptions in the future, Sempra Global must protest the PD's recommendation.

B. The proposed rule would unlawfully interfere with wholesale energy transactions.

Under the proposed rule for existing units, if a load-serving entity were to execute a new long-term, source-specific contract with an existing combined cycle natural gas-fired unit, that load-serving entity would be forced to impute the applicable default emission factor to the contract rather than the source-specific emission factors achieved by the actual unit. In the case of generation owned by Sempra Global's subsidiary, the source-specific emission factor would in most instances be *lower* than the default emissions factor that would be applied. In fact, even compared to the nominally lower default emission factor proposed for Pacific Northwest imports, the source-specific emissions factor would be only marginally, and from a commercial perspective negligibly, higher. The proposed rule would thus eliminate the incentive for load-serving entities to contract with existing low-emitting units, and leave those units vulnerable to competition from higher-emitting, but cheaper, fuels and technologies. In this regard, an existing

coal-fired unit would be benefited under the proposed rule since its higher source-specific emissions rate would also be disregarded from the load-serving entity's perspective – the load-serving entity signing a new contract with an existing coal-fired generating plant would report emissions using the appropriate default emissions factor, which in the case of every existing coal plant of which Sempra Global is aware, would be lower than the source-specific rate.

By eliminating any source-specific differentiation between low- and high-emitting resources solely on the basis that the plant was operational prior to January 1, 2008, the PD harms low-emitting units and benefits high-emitting units. This result cannot be the intent of either the Legislature or the Commission.

The practical effect of the proposed rule strips away any emissions-related incentive a load-serving entity would otherwise have to enter into a new contract with the low-emissions units, essentially stranding those units in a competition against identical, but newer, units and, even more irrationally, against existing coal-fired units with higher emissions but lower variable costs of operation. This outcome is wholly inconsistent with the very purpose of the greenhouse-gas emissions program, namely, providing incentives to load-serving entities to procure power from generating facilities with the lowest available emissions profiles. There is simply no reason to replace these incentives to “go low” with irrelevant criteria related to start-up dates or pre-existing contracts.

Throughout this proceeding, the Commission has expressed concerns about implementing a program that would survive constitutional scrutiny. A chief concern has been that the program could suffer fatal defects under the Commerce Clause of the Constitution of the United States. Because the proposed rule would have the effect of directing that wholesale sellers of electricity from existing units could only contract with their current counterparties, the rule could easily be

found to unlawfully interfere with interstate commerce. Also, limiting the seller's pool of potential buyers to a single party could be viewed as creating an unlawful restraint on trade. Viewed differently, leaving only a single load-serving entity as the sole potential buyer could be viewed as conferring monopsony power on that buyer, which in turn raises anti-trust concerns if that leverage is perceived as harmful to the market. At the very least, the seller would have little to no bargaining power under such circumstances. It would be ill-advised and unfortunate if the Commission were to make a recommendation that created or exacerbated its legal concerns, and it would do so here, since Commission's rationale for the proposed rule is highly speculative, and finds little to no support in the record. The Commission should eliminate this recommendation from the PD, rather than put the GHG reduction program at risk by this proposed rule.

C. The proposed rule undermines the goals of AB 32.

The long-run effects of the proposed rule would undermine what most parties presume should be the effect of Assembly Bill 32 on the power industry, *viz.*, a migration away from higher-emitting units and toward lower-emitting ones. The proposed rule will prevent this migration by placing all existing generating units, including ostensibly renewable resources, on an equal footing with respect to emissions – all existing units subject to the rule would compete with one another, whether for long-term contracts or through the short-term markets operated by the California Independent System Operator, using the applicable default emissions rate. This eliminates the incentives load-serving entities would otherwise have to discriminate among resource options based on the emissions profiles of differing units. Only by reflecting source-based emissions rates in the fixed and/or variable costs associated with every resource option will the incentives to load-serving entities be clear.

In the absence of the proposed rule as more and more low-emitting units, whether existing or new, are added to the resource portfolios of load-serving entities pursuant to source-specific contracts, the default emission factors would be expected to rise as the mix of units available to serve contracts without specified sources changes, with lower-emitting units leaving the pool and only higher-emitting units remaining. Removing the incentives for this attrition to occur is patently counterproductive to achieving reductions in emissions since it reduces, and may eliminate, any probability that higher-emitting units will be unable to compete and would be forced to exit the market or reduce their production.

Finally, Sempra Global strenuously objects to the contribution the proposed rule will make to the prejudice that existing units owned by independent power producers face in the California market. Sempra Global has frequently objected to the structural bias existing units face in the market for new long-term contracts. In several instances, existing units have been precluded from even bidding for certain contracts. This prejudice is reflected in the proposed rule related to emission factors. Where a load-serving entity owns an existing unit, it is permitted to use the actual emissions rate of the source. But where the load-serving entity contracts for capacity and/or energy from *that same or an identical unit* where owned by a third party, that load-serving entity is required to report the emissions from the using the applicable, and in Sempra Global's case, higher default emission factors. This results in the load-serving entity reporting greater than actual emissions for power generated by independent producers, while for its own units the load-serving entity would report lower emissions pursuant to the rules for self-owned units. This outcome is plainly irrational and discriminatory in its effect and fails to serve the GHG emissions reduction goals of AB 32 and the Commission.

The Commission's purported concern with contract shuffling cannot be used to justify

such blatant favoritism that serves no purpose in the overall scheme of the emissions program and may in fact serve to undermine the program. The proposed rule should be rejected, and further consideration given to more narrowly tailored measures that address the contract shuffling issue without the discriminatory effects of the rule as proposed in the PD.

III. CONCLUSION

The Commission's attempt to address contract shuffling by assigning a default emissions factor to contracts between load-serving entities and existing units unless (a) the purchase is made through a PPA that was in effect prior to January 1, 2008 and either is still in effect or has been renewed without interruption, or (b) the purchase is made through a PPA from a power plant that became operational on or after January 1, 2008 is an unsatisfactory solution to this problem. The proposed rule is speculative, unsupported by record evidence, raises numerous legal problems, is contrary to the objectives of AB 32, and blatantly discriminates against existing units owned by independent power producers. For all of these reasons, the Commission should reject this provision in the PD.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ THEODORE E. ROBERTS
Theodore E. Roberts

Attorney for Sempra Global
101 Ash Street, HQ 12B
San Diego, CA 92101-3017
Telephone: (619) 699-5111
Facsimile: (619) 699-5027
E-mail: troberts@sempra.com

August 24, 2007

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that I have this day served a copy of the foregoing **COMMENTS OF SEMPRA GLOBAL ON DRAFT INTERIM OPINION** on all parties identified in R.06-04-009 on the attached service list by U.S. mail and electronic mail, and by Federal Express to the assigned Commissioner(s) and Administrative Law Judge(s).

Dated at San Diego, California, this 24th day of August, 2007.

/s/ JOEL DELLOSA
Joel Delloso

CALIFORNIA PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION

Service Lists

Proceeding: R0604009 - CPUC - PG&E, SDG&E,
Filer: CPUC - PG&E, SDG&E, SOCALGAS, EDISON
List Name: LIST
Last changed: August 23, 2007

cadams@covantaenergy.com	CINDY	ADAMS
steven.schleimer@barclayscapital.com	STEVEN S.	SCHLEIMER
steven.huhman@morganstanley.com	STEVEN	HUHMAN
rick_noger@praxair.com	RICK C.	NOGER
keith.mccrea@sablaw.com	KEITH R.	MCCREA
ajkatz@mwe.com	ADAM J.	KATZ
ckrupka@mwe.com	CATHERINE M.	KRUPKA
lisa.decker@constellation.com	LISA M.	DECKER
cswoollums@midamerican.com	CATHY S.	WOOLLUMS
kevin.boudreaux@calpine.com	KEVIN	BOUDREAUX
trdill@westernhubs.com	THOMAS	DILL
ej_wright@oxy.com	E.J.	WRIGHT
pseby@mckennalong.com	PAUL M.	SEBY
todil@mckennalong.com	TIMOTHY R.	ODIL
steve.koerner@el Paso.com	STEPHEN G.	KOERNER, ESQ.
jenine.schenk@apses.com	JENINE	SCHENK
jbw@slwplc.com	JOHN B.	WELDON, JR.
kelly.barr@srpnet.com	KELLY	BARR
rrtaylor@srpnet.com	ROBERT R.	TAYLOR
smichel@westernresources.org	STEVEN S.	MICHEL
roger.montgomery@swgas.com	ROGER C.	MONTGOMERY
ron.deaton@ladwp.com	RONALD F.	DEATON
snewsom@semprautilities.com	SID	NEWSOME
dhuard@manatt.com	DAVID L.	HUARD
curtis.kebler@gs.com	CURTIS L.	KEBLER
dehling@kling.com	DENNIS M.P.	EHLING
gregory.koiser@constellation.com	GREGORY	KOISER
npedersen@hanmor.com	NORMAN A.	PEDERSEN
mmazur@3phasesRenewables.com	MICHAEL	MAZUR
tiffany.rau@bp.com	TIFFANY	RAU
klatt@energyattorney.com	GREGORY	KLATT
maureen@lennonassociates.com	MAUREEN	LENNON
rhelgeson@scppa.org	RICHARD	HELGESON
douglass@energyattorney.com	DANIEL W.	DOUGLASS
pssed@adelphia.net	PAUL	DELANEY
akbar.jazayeri@sce.com	AKBAR	JAZAYEIRI
annette.gilliam@sce.com	ANNETTE	GILLIAM
cathy.karlstad@sce.com	CATHY A.	KARLSTAD
Laura.Genao@sce.com	LAURA I.	GENAO
rkmoore@gswater.com	RONALD	MOORE

dwood8@cox.net
amsmith@sempra.com
atrial@sempra.com
apak@sempraglobal
dhecht@sempratrading.com
daking@sempra.com
svongdeuane@semprasolutions.com
troberts@sempra.com
liddell@energyattorney.com
marcie.milner@shell.com
rwinthrop@pilotpowergroup.com
tdarton@pilotpowergroup.com
lschavrien@semprautilities.com
GloriaB@anzaelectric.org
llund@commerceenergy.com
thunt@cecmail.org
jeanne.sole@sfgov.org
john.hughes@sce.com
llorenz@semprautilities.com
marcel@turn.org
nsuetake@turn.org
dil@cpuc.ca.gov
fjs@cpuc.ca.gov
achang@nrdc.org
rsa@a-klaw.com
ek@a-klaw.com
kgrenfell@nrdc.org
mpa@a-klaw.com
sls@a-klaw.com
bill.chen@constellation.com
bkc7@pge.com
epoole@adplaw.com
agrimaldi@mckennalong.com
bcragg@goodinmacbride.com
jsqueri@gmssr.com
jarmstrong@goodinmacbride.com
kbowen@winston.com
lcottle@winston.com
sbeatty@cwclaw.com
vprabhakaran@goodinmacbride.com
jkarp@winston.com
jeffgray@dwt.com
cjlw5@pge.com
ssmyers@att.net
lars@resource-solutions.org
alho@pge.com
aweller@sel.com
jchamberlin@strategicenergy.com
beth@beth411.com
kerry.hatlevik@mirant.com

DON
AIMEE M.
ALLEN K.
ALVIN
DAN
DANIEL A.
SYMONE
THEODORE
DONALD C.
MARCIE
REID A.
THOMAS
STEVE
GLORIA
LYNELLE
TAMLYN M.
JEANNE M.
JOHN P.
LAD
MARCEL
NINA
Diana L.
F. Jackson
AUDREY
DONALD
EVELYN
KRISTIN
MICHAEL P.
SEEMA
WILLIAM H.
BRIAN K.
EDWARD G
ANN G.
BRIAN T.
JAMES D.
JEANNE B.
KAREN
LISA A.
SEAN P.
VIDHYA
JOSEPH M.
JEFFREY P.
CHRISTOPHER J.
SARA STECK
LARS
ANDREW L.
ANDREA
JENNIFER
BETH
KERRY

WOOD
SMITH
TRIAL
PAK
HECHT
KING
VONGDEUANE
ROBERTS
LIDDELL, P.C.
MILNER
WINTHROP
DARTON
RAHON
BRITTON
LUND
HUNT
SOLE
HUGHES
LORENZ
HAWIGER
SUETAKE
Lee
Stoddard
CHANG
BROOKHYSER
KAHL
GRENFELL
ALCANTAR
SRINIVASAN
CHEN
CHERRY
POOLE
GRIMALDI
CRAGG
SQUERI
ARMSTRONG
BOWEN
COTTLE
BEATTY
PRABHAKARAN
KARP
GRAY
WARNER
MYERS
KVALE
HARRIS
WELLER
CHAMBERLIN
VAUGHAN
HATTEVIK

kowalewskia@calpine.com
wbooth@booth-law.com
hoerner@redefiningprogress.org
janill.richards@doj.ca.gov
cchen@ucsusa.org
gmorris@emf.net
tomb@crossborderenergy.com
bmcc@mccarthy.com
sberlin@mccarthy.com
anginc@goldrush.com
joyw@mid.org

jjensen@kirkwood.com
mary.lynch@constellation.com
lrdevanna-rf@cleanenergysystems.com
abb@eslawfirm.com
mclaughlin@braunlegal.com
glw@eslawfirm.com
jluckhardt@downeybrand.com
jdh@eslawfirm.com
vwelch@environmentaldefense.org
www@eslawfirm.com

westgas@aol.com
scohn@smud.org
atrowbridge@daycartermurphy.com
dansvec@hdo.net
notice@psrec.coop
deb@a-klaw.com
cynthia.schultz@pacificcorp.com
kyle.l.davis@pacificcorp.com
ryan.flynn@pacificcorp.com
carter@ieta.org
jason.dubchak@niskags.com
bjones@mjbbradley.com
kcolburn@symbioticstrategies.com
rapcowart@aol.com
Kathryn.Wig@nrgenergy.com
sasteriadis@apx.com
george.hopley@barcap.com
ez@pointcarbon.com
burtraw@rff.org
vb@pointcarbon.com
kyle_boudreaux@fpl.com
andrew.bradford@constellation.com
gbarch@knowledgeinenergy.com
ralph.dennis@constellation.com
smindel@knowledgeinenergy.com
brabe@umich.edu
bpotts@foley.com

AVIS
WILLIAM H.
J. ANDREW
JANILL
CLIFF
GREGG
R. THOMAS
BARRY F.
C. SUSIE
MIKE
JOY A.
BALDASSARO
JOHN
MARY
LEONARD
ANDREW
BRUCE
GREGGORY L.
JANE E.
JEFFERY D.
VIRGIL
WILLIAM W.
DOWNEY
RAYMOND J.
STEVEN M.
ANN L.
DAN
JESSICA
DONALD
CYNTHIA
KYLE L.
RYAN
IAN
JASON
BRIAN M.
KENNETH A.
RICHARD
KATHRYN
SAKIS
GEORGE
ELIZABETH
DALLAS
VERONIQUE
KYLE D.
ANDREW
GARY
RALPH E.
SAMARA
BARRY
BRIAN

KOWALEWSKI
BOOTH
HOERNER
RICHARDS
CHEN
MORRIS
BEACH
MCCARTHY
BERLIN
LAMOND
WARREN
DI CAPO
JENSEN
LYNCH
DEVANNA
BROWN
MCLAUGHLIN
WHEATLAND
LUCKHARDT
HARRIS
WELCH
WESTERFIELD, 111
BRAND
CZAHAR, C.P.A.
COHN
TROWBRIDGE
SILVERIA
NELSON
BROOKHYSER
SCHULTZ
DAVIS
FLYNN
CARTER
DUBCHAK
JONES
COLBURN
COWART
WIG
ASTERIADIS
HOPLEY
ZELLJADT
BURTRAW
BUGNION
BOUDREAUX
BRADFORD
BARCH
DENNIS
MINDEL
RABE
POTTS

james.keating@bp.com
jimross@r-c-s-inc.com
tcarlson@reliant.com
ghinners@reliant.com
zaiontj@bp.com
julie.martin@bp.com
fiji.george@elpaso.com
echiang@elementmarkets.com
nenbar@energy-insights.com
nlenssen@energy-insights.com
bbaker@summitblue.com
william.tomlinson@elpaso.com
kjsimonsen@ems-ca.com
plusk@wecc.biz
Sandra.ely@state.nm.us
bmcquown@reliant.com
dbrooks@nevp.com
anita.hart@swgas.com
randy.sable@swgas.com
bill.schrand@swgas.com
jj.prucnal@swgas.com
meridith.strand@swgas.com
ckmitchell1@sbcglobal.net
chilen@sppc.com
emello@sppc.com
tdillard@sierrapacific.com
dsoyars@sppc.com
fluchetti@ndep.nv.gov
leilani.johnson@ladwp.com
Lorraine.Paskett@ladwp.com
randy.howard@ladwp.com
robert.pettinato@ladwp.com
hyao@semprautilities.com
rprince@semprautilities.com
rkeen@manatt.com
nwhang@manatt.com
pjazayeri@stroock.com
derek@climateregistry.org
david@nemtzw.com
harveyederpspc.org@hotmail.com
vitaly.lee@aes.com
sendo@ci.pasadena.ca.us
slins@ci.glendale.ca.us
THAMILTON5@CHARTER.NET
bjeider@ci.burbank.ca.us
rmorillo@ci.burbank.ca.us
roger.pelote@williams.com
aimee.branes@ecosecurities.com
case.admin@sce.com
tim.hemig@nrgenergy.com

JAMES W.
JAMES
TRENT A.
GARY
JEANNE
JULIE L.
FIJI
ED
NADAV
NICHOLAS
ELIZABETH
WAYNE
KEVIN J.
PHILIP D.
SANDRA
BRIAN
DOUGLAS
ANITA
RANDY
BILL
JJ
MERIDITH J.
CYNTHIA
CHRISTOPHER A.
ELENA
TREVOR
DARRELL
FRANK
LEILANI
LORRAINE
RANDY S.
ROBERT L.
HUGH
RASHA
RANDALL W.
S. NANCY
PETER
DEREK
DAVID
HARVEY
VITALY
STEVE
STEVEN G.
TOM
BRUNO
RICHARD J.
ROGER
AIMEE
CASE
TIM

KEATING
ROSS
CARLSON
HINNERS
ZAIONTZ
MARTIN
GEORGE
CHIANG
ENBAR
LENSSEN
BAKER
TOMLINSON
SIMONSEN
LUSK
ELY
MCQUOWN
BROOKS
HART
SABLE
SCHRAND
PRUCNAL
STRAND
MITCHELL
HILEN
MELLO
DILLARD
SOYARS
LUCHETTI
JOHNSON KOWAL
PASKETT
HOWARD
PETTINATO
YAO
PRINCE
KEEN
WHANG
JAZAYERI
MARKOLF
NEMTZOW
EDER
LEE
ENDO
LINS
HAMILTON
JEIDER
MORILLO
PELOTE
BARNES
ADMINISTRATION
HEMIG

bjl@bry.com
aldyn.hoekstra@paceglobal.com
ygross@sempraglobal.com
jlaun@apogee.net
kмкиener@fox.net
scottanders@sandiego.edu
jkloberdanz@semprautilities.com
andrew.mcallister@energycenter.org
jack.burke@energycenter.org
jennifer.porter@energycenter.org
sephra.ninow@energycenter.org
jleslie@luce.com
ofoote@hkcf-law.com
ekgrubaugh@iid.com
pepper@cleanpowermarkets.com
gsmith@adamsbroadwell.com
mdjoseph@adamsbroadwell.com
diane_fellman@fpl.com
hayley@turn.org
mflorio@turn.org
Dan.adler@calcef.org
mhyams@sfwater.org
tburke@sfwater.org
norman.furuta@navy.mil
amber@ethree.com
annabelle.malins@fco.gov.uk
dwang@nrdc.org
filings@a-klaw.com
nes@a-klaw.com
obystrom@cera.com
sdhilton@stoel.com
scarter@nrdc.org
abonds@thelen.com
cbaskette@enernoc.com
colin.petheram@att.com
jwmctarnaghan@duanemorris.com
kfox@wsgr.com
kkhoja@thelenreid.com
pvallen@thelen.com
spauker@wsgr.com
rreinhard@mofo.com
cem@newsdata.com
hgolub@nixonpeabody.com
jscancarelli@flk.com
jwiedman@goodinmacbride.com
mmattes@nossaman.com
jen@cnt.org
lisa_weinzimer@platts.com
steven@moss.net
sellis@fypower.org

BARRY
ALDYN
YVONNE
JOHN
KIM
SCOTT J.
JOSEPH R.
ANDREW
JACK
JENNIFER
SEPHRA A.
JOHN W.
ORLANDO B.
ELSTON K.
JAN
GLORIA D.
MARC D.
DIANE I.
HAYLEY
MICHEL
DAN
MICHAEL A.
THERESA
NORMAN J.
AMBER
ANNABELLE
DEVRA
KAREN
NORA
OLOF
SETH
SHERYL
ASHLEE M.
CARMEN E.
COLIN
JAMES W.
KEVIN
KHURSHID
PETER V.
SHERIDAN J.
ROBERT J.

HOWARD V.
JANINE L.
JOSEPH F.
MARTIN A.
JEN
LISA
STEVEN
SHAUN

LOVELL
HOEKSTRA
GROSS
LAUN
KIENER
ANDERS
KLOBERDANZ
MCALLISTER
BURKE
PORTER
NINOW
LESLIE
FOOTE, III
GRUBAUGH
PEPPER
SMITH
JOSEPH
FELLMAN
GOODSON
FLORIO
ADLER
HYAMS
BURKE
FURUTA
MAHONE
MALINS
WANG
TERRANOVA
SHERIFF
BYSTROM
HILTON
CARTER
BONDS
BASKETTE
PETHERAM
TARNAGHAN
FOX
KHOJA
ALLEN
PAUKER
REINHARD

GOLUB
SCANCARELLI
WIEDMAN
MATTES
MCGRAW
WEINZIMER
MOSS
ELLIS

arno@recurrentenergy.com
ELL5@pge.com
gxl2@pge.com
jxa2@pge.com
JDF1@PGE.COM
sscb@pge.com
svs6@pge.com
S1L7@pge.com
vjw3@pge.com
karla.dailey@cityofpaloalto.org
farrokh.albuyeh@oati.net
greg.blue@sbcglobal.net
dtibbs@aes4u.com
jhahn@covantaenergy.com
andy.vanhorn@vhcenergy.com
info@calseia.org
Joe.paul@dynegey.com
monica.schwebs@bingham.com
phanschen@mofo.com
josephhenri@hotmail.com
pthompson@summitblue.com
dietrichlaw2@earthlink.net
Betty.Seto@kema.com
JerryL@abag.ca.gov
jody_london_consulting@earthlink.net
steve@schiller.com
mrw@mrwassoc.com
rschmidt@bartlewells.com
adamb@greenlining.org
clyde.murley@comcast.net
brenda.lemay@horizonwind.com
carla.peterman@gmail.com
elvine@lbl.gov
rhwisner@lbl.gov
C_Marnay@1b1.gov
philm@scdenenergy.com
rita@ritanortonconsulting.com
cpechman@powereconomics.com
emahlon@ecoact.org
richards@mid.org
chrism@mid.org
rogerv@mid.org
fwmonier@tid.org
brbarkovich@earthlink.net
johnrredding@earthlink.net
clark.bernier@rlw.com
rmccann@umich.edu
cmkehrein@ems-ca.com
e-recipient@caiso.com
grosenblum@caiso.com

ARNO
ED
GRACE
JASMIN
JONATHAN
SEBASTIEN
SOUMYA
STEPHANIE
VALERIE J.
KARLA
FARROKH
GREG
DEAN R.
JEFFREY L.
ANDREW J.
SUE
JOSEPH M.
MONICA A.
PETER W.
JOSEPH
PATRICIA
WILLIAM F.
BETTY
GERALD L.
JODY S.
STEVEN

REED V.
ADAM
CLYDE
BRENDA
CARLA
EDWARD
RYAN
CHRIS
PHILLIP J.
RITA
CARL
MAHLON
RICHARD
CHRISTOPHER J.
ROGER
WES
BARBARA R.
JOHN R.
CLARK
RICHARD
CAROLYN M.

GRANT

HARRIS
LUCHA
LIVINGSTON-NUNLEY
ANSAR
FORRESTER
CSAPO
SASTRY
LA SHAWN
WINN
DAILEY
ALBUYEH
BLUE
TIBBS
HAHN
VAN HORN
KATELEY
PAUL
SCHWEBS, ESQ.
HANSCHEN
HENRI
THOMPSON
DIETRICH
SETO
LAHR
LONDON
SCHILLER

SCHMIDT
BRIONES
MURLEY
LEMAY
PETERMAN
VINE
WISER
MARNAY
MULLER
NORTON
PECHMAN
ALDRIDGE
SMITH
MAYER
VAN HOY
MONIER
BARKOVICH
REDDING
BERNIER
MCCANN, PH.D
KEHREIN

ROSENBLUM, ESQ.

rsmutny-jones@caiso.com	KAREN	EDSON
saeed.farrokhpay@ferc.gov	ROBIN	SMUTNY-JONES
david@branchcomb.com	SAEED	FARROKHPAY
kenneth.swain@navigantconsulting.com	DAVID	BRANCHCOMB
kdusel@navigantconsulting.com	KENNY	SWAIN
gpickering@navigantconsulting.com	KIRBY	DUSEL
lpark@navigantconsulting.com	GORDON	PICKERING
davidreynolds@ncpa.com	LAURIE	PARK
scott.tomashefsky@ncpa.com	DAVID	REYNOLDS
ewolfe@resero.com	SCOTT	TOMASHEFSKY
Audra.Hartmann@Dynegy.com	ELLEN	WOLFE
Bob.lucas@calobby.com	AUDRA	HARTMANN
curt.barry@iwpnews.com	BOB	LUCAS
dave@ppallc.com	CURT	BARRY
kellie.smith@sen.ca.gov	DAVID L.	MODISETTE
mwaugh@arb.ca.gov	KELLIE	SMITH
pstoner@lgc.org	MICHAEL	WAUGH
rachel@ceert.org	PATRICK	STONER
wtasat@arb.ca.gov	RACHEL	MCMAHON
steven@iepa.com	WEBSTER	TASAT
etiedemann@kmtg.com	STEVEN	KELLY
bushinskyj@pewclimate.org	EDWARD J.	TIEDEMANN
lmh@eslawfirm.com	JOSHUA	BUSHINSKY
obartho@smud.org	LYNN	HAUG
bbeebe@smud.org	OBADIAH	BARTHOLOMY
bpurewal@water.ca.gov	BUD	BEEBE
dmacml@water.ca.gov	BALWANT S.	PUREWAL
kmills@cfbf.com	DOUGLAS	MACMULLLEN
karen@klindh.com	KAREN NORENE	MILLS
ehadley@reupower.com	KAREN	LINDH
Denise_Hill@transalta.com	ELIZABETH W.	HADLEY
sas@a-klaw.com	DENISE	HILL
egw@a-klaw.com	ANNIE	STANGE
akelly@climatetrust.org	ELIZABETH	WESTBY
alan.comnes@nrgenergy.com	ALEXIA C.	KELLY
kyle.silon@ecosecurities.com	ALAN	COMNES
californiadockets@pacificorp.com	KYLE	SILON
Philip.H.Carver@state.or.us	CATHIE	ALLEN
samuel.r.sadler@state.or.us	PHIL	CARVER
lisa.c.schwartz@state.or.us	SAM	SADLER
cbreidenich@yahoo.com	LISA	SCHWARTZ
dws@r-c-s-inc.com	CLARE	BREIDENICH
jesus.arredondo@nrgenergy.com	DONALD	SCHOENBECK
charlie.blair@delta-ee.com	JESUS	ARREDONDO
karen.mcdonald@powerex.com	CHARLIE	BLAIR
loe@cpuc.ca.gov	KAREN	MCDONALD
clarence.binninger@doj.ca.gov	James	Loewen
david.zonana@doj.ca.gov	CLARENCE	BINNINGER
agc@cpuc.ca.gov	DAVID	ZONANA
	Andrew	Campbell

aeg@cpuc.ca.gov
blm@cpuc.ca.gov
cft@cpuc.ca.gov
tam@cpuc.ca.gov
dsh@cpuc.ca.gov
edm@cpuc.ca.gov
cpe@cpuc.ca.gov
hym@cpuc.ca.gov
hs1@cpuc.ca.gov
jm3@cpuc.ca.gov
jnm@cpuc.ca.gov
jbf@cpuc.ca.gov
jk1@cpuc.ca.gov
jst@cpuc.ca.gov
jtp@cpuc.ca.gov
jol@cpuc.ca.gov
jci@cpuc.ca.gov
jf2@cpuc.ca.gov
krd@cpuc.ca.gov
lrm@cpuc.ca.gov
litt@cpuc.ca.gov
mjd@cpuc.ca.gov
meg@cpuc.ca.gov
ner@cpuc.ca.gov
pw1@cpuc.ca.gov
psp@cpuc.ca.gov
pzs@cpuc.ca.gov
rmm@cpuc.ca.gov
ram@cpuc.ca.gov
smk@cpuc.ca.gov
sgm@cpuc.ca.gov
svn@cpuc.ca.gov
scr@cpuc.ca.gov
tcx@cpuc.ca.gov
ken.alex@doj.ca.gov
ken.alex@doj.ca.gov
bdicapo@caiso.com
jsanders@caiso.com
jgill@caiso.com

ppettingill@caiso.com
mscheibl@arb.ca.gov
gottstein@volcano.net
pburmich@arb.ca.gov
bblevins@energy.state.ca.us
dmetz@energy.state.ca.us
deborah.slone@doj.ca.gov
dks@cpuc.ca.gov
kgriffin@energy.state.ca.us
ldecarlo@energy.state.ca.us

Anne
Beth
Charlotte
Christine S.
Donald R.
Ed
Eugene
Harvey Y.
Henry
Jaclyn
Jacqueline
Jamie
Jason R.
George S.
Joel T.
Jonathan
Judith
Julie A.
Kristin
Lainie
Lana
Matthew
Meg
Nancy
Pamela
Paul S.
Pearlie
Rahmon
Richard A.
Sara M.
Scott
Sean A.
Steve
Theresa
BILL
KEN
BALDASSARO
JUDITH B.
JULIE
MARY
PHILIP D.
MICHAEL
MEG
PAM
B. B.
DARYL
DEBORAH
Don
KAREN
LISA

Gillette
Moore
TerKeurst
Tam
Smith
Moldavsky
Cadenasso
Morris
Stern
Marks
Greig
Fordyce
Salmi Klotz
Tagnipes
Perlstein
Lakritz
Ikle
Fitch
Ralff Douglas
Motamedi
Tran
Deal
Gottstein
Ryan
Wellner
Phillips
Sabino
Momoh
Myers
Kamins
Murtishaw
Simon
Roscow
Cho
LOCKYER
ALEX
DICAPO
SANDERS
GILL
MCDONALD
PETTINGILL
SCHEIBLE
GOTTSTEIN
BURMICH
BLEVINS
METZ
SLON
Schultz
GRIFFIN
DECARLO

mpryor@energy.state.ca.us
mgarcia@arb.ca.gov
pduvair@energy.state.ca.us
wsm@cpuc.ca.gov
hurlock@water.ca.gov
hcronin@water.ca.gov

MARC
MICHELLE
PIERRE H.
Wade
CAROL J.
HOLLY B.

PRYOR
GARCIA
DUVAIR
McCartney
HURLOCK
CRONIN